

# **FAX**

			<del></del>	1			
То:	Ms. Pilar Laguaña President & CEO Guam Visitors Bureau 401 Pale San Vitores Road Tumon, Guam 96913 Phone: (671) 646-5278 Fax: (671) 646-3917/646-8861  Thomas J. Fisher, Esq. (Attorney for GVB) Fisher & Associates 167 East Marine Corp. Drive Hagåtña, Guam 96910 Phone: (671) 472-1131 Fax: (671) 472-2886		From:	Anthony Camacho Hearing Officer Office of Public Accountability			
			Pages:	6 (including cover page)			
	Mr. Luis E. Bustamante President Appellant: JJ Global Services		Date:	March 25, 2019			
CC:	215 Rojas Street, Sui Harmon Industrial Pa Tamuning, Guam 96 Tel: (671) 632-1179 Fax: (671) 632-3550 Vanessa L. William (Attorney for Appel Law Office of Vanes 414 West Soledad A GCIC Bldg., Suite 50 Hagåtña, Guam 9691 Tel: (671) 477-1389 Email: VLW@vlwill Mitchell F. Thomps (Attorney for Interes Systems, Inc.) Thompson Thompso 238 Archbishop Flor Hagåtña, Guam 9691 Tel: (671) 472-2089 Fax: (671) 477-5206	s, Esq. llant JJ Global) sa L. Williams, P.C. venue 00 0 liamslaw.com on, Esq. ested Party Landscape Management on & Alcantara es Street, Suite 801 0	Phone: Fax:	(671) 475-0390 x. 208 (671) 472-7951			
Re:	OPA-PA-19-001 Decision and Order RE Appellant's Motion for Injunctive Relief and Stay of Procurement and For Final Decision on Second Protest						
□ Urgent	☐ For Review	☐ Please Comment ✓ Please Re	ply 🗆 🛚	Please Recycle			
Comments: Please acknowledge	owledge receipt of th	is transmittal by re-sending this cover page a	llong with y	our firm or agency's receipt stamp,			
date, and in	tials of receiver						
	Thank you,						
			ck Hernande				
	ihernandez@guamopa.com						

This facsimile transmission and accompanying documents may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this fax transmission, please call our office and notify us immediately. Do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you.



OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY
PROCUREMENT APPEALS

4

1

2

3

5

6

7

9

10

11

To:

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

23

2425

26

27

28

APPEAL NO: OPA-PA-19-001

DECISION AND ORDER RE APPELLANT'S MOTION FOR INJUNCTIVE RELIEF AND STAY OF PROCUREMENT AND FOR FINAL DECISION ON SECOND PROTEST

### Purchasing Agency:

Appellant

Guam Visitor's Bureau C/O Thomas J. Fisher, Esq. Fisher & Associates 167 East Marine Corps Drive Hagåtña, Guam, 96910 Facsimile: (671) 472-2886

### Appellant:

IN THE APPEAL OF,

JJ GLOBAL SERVICES,

JJ Global Services C/O Vanessa L. Williams, Esq. Law Office of Vanessa L. Williams P.C. 414 W. Soledad Ave., Suite 500 Hagåtña, Guam, 96910 Email: VLW@vlwilliamslaw.com

#### **Interested Party:**

Landscape Management Systems, Inc. C/O Mitchell F. Thompson, Esq. Thompson Thompson & Alcantara 238 Archbishop Flores Street, Suite 801 Hagåtña, Guam, 96910 Facsimile: (671) 477-5206

THIS MATTER, came before the Hearing Officer for Procurement Appeals on March 5, 2019 for a hearing on the Appellant's Motion for Injunctive Relief and Stay of Procurement Pending Final Resolution of Appeal and for Order Requiring the Guam Visitor's Bureau to issue a Final Decision on Protest 2 that was filed in this matter on February 6, 2019. Keiko

Decision & Order Re Appellant's Motion for Injunctive Relief - 1

Bustamante was present on behalf of the Appellant and he was represented by the Appellant's
Counsel of Record, Vanessa L. Williams, Esq. Pilar Laguana appeared on behalf of the
Purchasing Agency and she was represented by the Purchasing Agency's Counsel of Record,
Thomas J. Fisher, Esq. Robert Salas appeared on behalf of the Interested Party and he was
represented by the Interested Party's Counsel of Record, Mitchell F. Thompson, Esq.

BACKGROUND

The Appellant makes two motion. First, the Appellant moves the Office of Public Accountability (OPA) for a temporary restraining order restraining and enjoining the Purchasing Agency from continuing contract performance for GVB-IFB-2018-001 (Tumon Landscape Maintenance) (Hereafter Referred to as "IFB"). Second, the Appellant moves the OPA to order the Purchasing Agency to issue a final decision on a second protest it filed concerning the IFB on December 27, 2018. Appellant's Motion at 1-2.

#### DISCUSSION

The OPA does not have the Jurisdiction to Enjoin and Restrain the Purchasing Agency

The OPA does not have the jurisdiction to impose injunctive relief on the Purchasing Agency. The Public Auditor shall have the power to review and determine *de novo* any matter properly submitted to him. 5 G.C.A. §5703 and 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12103(a). For procurement protests, any actual or prospective bidder, offeror, or contractor who may be aggrieved in connection source selection, solicitation or award of a contract, may protest to the Chief Procurement Officer, the Director of Public Works, or the head of a purchasing agency. 5 G.C.A. §5425(a). If the protest is not resolved by mutual agreement, the Chief Procurement Officer, the Director of Public Works, the head of a purchasing agency, or the designee of one of these officers shall promptly issue a decision in writing and such decision may be appealed by the protestant to the Public Auditor within fifteen days after receipt by the protestant of the notice of decision. 5 G.C.A. §5425(c) and (e) and 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 9, §9101(g). The Public Auditor shall determine whether a decision on the protest of method of selection,

solicitation, or award of the contract, or entitlement of costs is in accordance with the statutes, regulations, and the terms and conditions of the solicitation. 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12112. The Public Auditor shall issue a decision in writing or take other appropriate action on each appeal submitted. 5 G.C.A. §5702. Hence, for an appeal of a procurement protest, the Public Auditor's jurisdiction is limited to reviewing the Purchasing Agency's protest decision *de novo* to determine whether the decision on the protest of method of selection, solicitation, or award of the contract, or entitlement of costs is in accordance with the statutes, regulations, and the terms and conditions of the solicitation and issue a decision in writing or take other appropriate action. Further, the aforementioned statutes governing the Public Auditor's jurisdiction concerning reviews of procurement protest decisions do not include granting requests for injunction relief.

The Superior Court of Guam has the authority to grant injunctive relief. The Superior Court of Guam's power to issue injunctive relief in a procurement dispute is granted by 5 G.C.A. §5480(c). *Teleguam Holdings LLC*, v. *Territory of Guam*, 2015 Guam 13, ¶33. That part of Guam's Procurement Law states that the Superior Court of Guam has the jurisdiction to grant injunctive relief in an action between the Government of Guam and a bidder, offeror, or contractor, either actual or prospective, to determine whether the solicitation or award of a contract is in accordance with the statutes, regulations, and the terms and conditions of the solicitation. 5 G.C.A. §5480(a) and (c). The procedures for obtaining injunctive relief from the Superior Court of Guam are set forth in Rule 16, Guam Rules of Civil Procedure (GRCP) and Rule 65(d), GRCP governs the issuance of a temporary restraining order. *Teleguam Holdings LLC* at ¶33. This rule of civil procedure is not applicable OPA. Therefore, the authority to issue a temporary injunction pursuant to Rule 65(d), GRCP is vested in the Superior Court of Guam pursuant to 5 G.C.A. §5480(c) and not the OPA.

The OPA is not persuaded by the Appellant's argument that 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12115 confers upon the OPA the jurisdiction to render injunctive relief. Appellant's Reply at

2.1 That regulation is inapplicable to this matter because it concerns the procedure for the OPA to determine an appeal of a Purchasing Agency's written determination to avoid the automatic stay of procurement because awarding a contract without delay is necessary to protect substantial interests of the territory in accordance with 5 G.C.A. §5425(g). Here, the Purchasing Agency has not made any such determination and this matter is not the appeal of such determination made in accordance with 5 G.C.A. §5425(g). Therefore, 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12115 is inapplicable to this matter.

### The Appellant's Second Protest is not Properly before the OPA

The Appellant's second protest concerning the IFB and filed on December 27, 2018 is not properly before the OPA. The Public Auditor shall have the power to review and determine *de novo* any matter properly submitted to him. 5 G.C.A. §5703 and 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12103(a). The Public Auditor shall determine whether a decision on the protest of method of selection, solicitation, or award of the contract, or entitlement of costs is in accordance with the statutes, regulations, and the terms and conditions of the solicitation. 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12112. Here, the Appellant admits that the Purchasing Agency has not rendered a decision on its December 27, 2018 protest. Appellant's Motion at 4. Hence, the Appellant's December 27, 2018 decision is not properly before the OPA because there is no decision by the Purchasing Agency concerning this protest for the OPA to review.

Despite the foregoing, the OPA does note that, as of the date of this decision, it has been nearly three months since the Appellant filed its December 27, 2018 protest with the Purchasing Agency. The Purchasing Agency is reminded that Guam Procurement Laws and Regulations require that if the protest is not resolved by mutual agreement, the Purchasing Agency is required to **promptly**, and as **expeditiously as possible**, issue a decision in writing (Bold Emphasis Added). 5 G.C.A. §5425(c) and 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 9, §9101(g)(1).

The Appellant cites: "2 G.A.R. §12215." However, this regulation does not exist and the OPA believes that this was an erroneous reference to 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12115.

# 

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the foregoing, the Hearing Officer hereby DENIES the Appellant's Motion for Injunctive Relief and Stay of Procurement Pending Final Resolution of Appeal and for Order Requiring the Purchasing Agency to issue a Final Decision on the Appellant's second protest.

**SO ORDERED** this 25<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2019 by:

Anthony R. Camacho, ESQ.

Hearing Officer

## **Broadcast Report**

Date/Time Local ID 1 03-25-2019 6714727951 02:38:33 p.m.

Transmit Header Text Local Name 1

OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC AUDITOR

This document: Confirmed (reduced sample and details below)

Document size: 8.5"x11"

Suite 401 DNA Building 238 Archbishop Flores St. Hagātāa, Guam 96910



### FAX

	Ms. Pilar Laguaña President & CEO Guam Visitors Bureau 401 Pale San Vitores Road Tumon, Guam 96913 Phone: (671) 646-5278 Fax: (671) 646-3917/646-8861 Thomas J. Fisher, Esq.			Fron:	Anthony Camacho Hearing Officer Office of Public Accountability		
Tn:				Pages:	6 (including cover page)		
	(Attorney for GVI Fisher & Associates 167 East Marine Co Hagatha, Guam 969 Phone: (671) 472-1 Fax: (671) 472-288	rp. Drive 10 131 5					
	Mr. Luis E. Bustamante President Appellant: JJ Global Services			Date:	March 25, 2019		
cc:	215 Rojas Street, Si Hurmon Industrial Tamuning, Guam 9 Tel: (671) 632-1175 Fax: (671) 632-355 Vanessa L. Williar (Attorney for App Law Office of Vane 414 West Soledad 2 GCIC Bldg., Suite: Hugditla, Guam 965 Tel: (671) 477-1385 Email: VLW@vlwi Mitchell F. Thomp (Attorney for Inter Systems, Inc.) Thompson Thomps 238 Archbishop Fle Hagdifla, Guam 965 Tel: (671) 472-2085 Fax: (671) 477-520	nite 126 *ark 5913 **) ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** **		Phone: Fax:	(671) 475-0390 x. 208 (671) 472-7951		
Re:	OPA-PA-19-001 L For Final Decision	on Second Protest	int's Motion for	injunctive	Relief and Stay of Procurement an		
□ Urgent	☐ For Review	☐ Please Comment	→ Please Rep	ily 🗆	Please Recycle		
Comments Please ackn	: owledge receipt of t	ils transmittal by re-sending t	nis cover page al	ong with y	our firm or agency's receipt stamp		
date, and in	itials of receiver						
	Thank you, Jerrick Hernandez, Auditor						
	Jennok Helilandez Addikoi						

This facsimile transmission and accumpanying documents may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not die intended recipient of this fax transmission, please call our office and notify us immediately. Do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you.

jhemandez@guamopa.com

Total Pages Scanned: 6

**Total Pages Confirmed: 30** 

9									
No.	Job	Remote Station	Start Time	Duration	Pages	Line	Mode	Job Type	Results
001	946	6716463917	02:16:20 p.m. 03-25-2019	00:01:31	6/6	1	EC	HS	CP21600
002	946	6716468861	02:16:20 p.m. 03-25-2019	00:01:52	6/6	1	EC	HS	CP16800
003	946	472 2886	02:16:20 p.m. 03-25-2019	00:01:38	6/6	1	EC	HS	CP24000
004	946	6716323550	02:16:20 p.m. 03-25-2019	00:01:35	6/6	1	EC	HS	CP21600
005	946	4775206	02:16:20 p.m. 03-25-2019	00:02:06	6/6	1	EC	HS	CP14400



Jerrick Hernandez < jhernandez@guamopa.com>

### OPA-PA-19-001 Decision and Order RE Appellant's Motion for Injunctive Relief and Stay of Procurement and For Final Decision on Second Protest

1 message

Jerrick Hernandez < ihernandez@guamopa.com> To: Vanessa Williams <vlw@vlwilliamslaw.com>

Mon, Mar 25, 2019 at 2:49 PM

Hafa Adai!

Please confirm receipt of this email and the attached document.

Regards,

Jerrick J.J.G. Hernandez, CGAP, CICA Office of Public Accountability - Guam www.opaguam.org Tel. (671) 475-0390 ext. 208 Fax (671) 472-7951

This e-mail transmission and accompanying attachment(s) may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this e-mail, please inform the sender and delete it and any other electronic or hard copies immediately. Please do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you.

Decision and Order RE Appellant's Motion for Injunctive Relief and Stay of Procurement and For Final **Decision on Second Protest.pdf** 250K